

LEH355/PHI370 – LEGAL REASONING – FALL 2017

MARCELLO DI BELLO – LEHMAN COLLEGE, CUNY

ASSIGNMENT #5 – DUE NOV 15

Please bring a hard copy to class and upload your assignment on the course website.

No late assignments are accepted.

Mock trial court case analysis Read carefully the materials relevant for your mock trial, such as opinions, legal briefs, oral arguments. Write 2-3 page note about the case, divided in sections (a) through (f). *No essay format please.*

- (a) The question (or questions) at issue about which the court was asked to decide
- (b) The undisputed facts of the case
- (c) The law applying to the case
- (d) The decision of the court, i.e. how it answered the question (or questions) at issue
- (e) The three best arguments supporting the decision of the court
- (f) The three best arguments challenging the decision of the court
- (g) Reflect on the arguments in (e) and (f). Were they based on certain tools of legal interpretation, such as text, history, tradition, etc.? Were they based on evidence, and if so, what type of evidence (scientific, testimonial, numerical, etc.) did they use?
- (h) Assess the comparative strength of each argument relative to the arguments for the other side. Trace the political ideology, if any, that underlies each argument.