

LEGAL PROBABILISM

MARCELLO DI BELLO – ASU

READING GUIDE – WEEK #9

Pennington and Hastie 1993:

The Story Model This section describes the three main components of the story model: story construction (pp. 194-199), learning verdicts (pp. 199-200) and matching stories to verdicts and reaching decisions (pp. 200-203). Pay attention to the first part. What principles guide story construction? How are stories evaluated?

Empirical evidence This section describes several experiments that P and H performed to give empirical support to the story model (pp. 203-213) and also compare it to other models, such as the probability-based, Bayesian model (pp. 213-217).

Fenton et al 2020:

Sec 2 Bayesian networks and how they rely on Bayes's theorem, the likelihood ratio, and idioms

Sec 3 how Bayesian networks can model the evidence in the Simonshaven case

Sec 4 how the guilt probability can change in light of the evidence considered and depending on the input probabilities entered into the Bayesian network

Sec 5/6 discussion, in particular see questions on pp. 1110-1111

Precis. No specific instructions this week. Your precis should describe (a) topic of the paper (or court opinion); (b) main thesis (or theses, if more than one); (c) supporting arguments; (d) objections to these arguments, complications or difficulties that the author considers (if any).

A precis should be no more than one page. If you want to write more, that's fine, but do not exaggerate! Be clear, simple, and concise. Due at the beginning of class.